



Memorandum

TO: PUBLIC SAFETY, FINANCE, AND
STRATEGIC SUPPORT COMMITTEE

FROM: Edgardo Garcia
Chief of Police

SUBJECT: POLICE DEPARTMENT
RECRUITMENT ACTIVITY
SEMI-ANNUAL REPORT

DATE: October 10, 2018

Approved

Date

10-11-18

RECOMMENDATION

Accept the semi-annual report on Police Department recruitment activity, including recruiting and hiring expenditures, communication/marketing activities, marketing and outreach data analysis, academy entrants' data analysis, officer resignation data analysis, and diverse applicant pool applications/hiring efforts.

BACKGROUND

On December 1, 2015, as part of their review of the Police Department Hiring Audit, the City Council directed the City Manager to report to the Public Safety, Finance, and Strategic Support Committee on the Police Academy recruitment cycle with a Recruitment Activity Report, beginning in spring 2016. The report was to include the following:

- a. Funds expended to date in recruiting and hiring, and the uses of funds;
- b. The nature, intended audiences, and outcomes of various communication and marketing activities such as, but not limited to, advertising on radio, billboards, signage on city owned vehicles, and other advertising;
- c. Use and analysis of data identifying those specific marketing and outreach activities that yield the best results, and to assess optimal marginal allocation of future resources;
- d. Data describing measurements of results specific to the ethnic and gender make-up of sub-categories of academy entrants;
- e. Data describing the reasons officers are resigning from the Department (e.g., retirement, moving to another city department, resignation in lieu of termination, etc.); and
- f. The status of efforts to boost applications and hiring of women, veterans, and a diverse applicant pool by re-focusing marketing, as suggested above.

On October 4, 2016, the City Council heard and accepted a special report, "Police Department Staffing and Discussion of Options to Address the Unprecedented Low Staffing Levels in the Patrol Division,"¹ which included a detailed overview of the Department's police officer recruiting efforts. Subsequently, the Police Department provided semi-annual reports on police

¹ Council report: http://saniose.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php?view_id=&event_id=2156&meta_id=594329

officer recruitment activity to the PSFSS Committee on October 20, 2016², April 20, 2017³, and October 19, 2017⁴ and April 19, 2018⁵.

As recommended by the Public Safety, Finance, and Strategic Support Committee on February 15, 2018, the Department has included a new section to this report to provide additional information on recruiting and outreach efforts in the Communications Division to fill Public Safety Communications Specialist and Public Safety Radio Dispatcher positions.

ANALYSIS

The San José Police Department Recruiting Unit currently accepts police officer applications year-round and holds three academies (October, February, and June) per fiscal year. The recruiting cycle is approximately four months per academy; however, the timeline for each recruit may vary from four to nine months from application to enrollment in the academy, depending on when in the cycle a recruit applies. This month, the Department will begin the October Academy with 50 recruits. The Department exceeded the hiring demand for the October 2018 Academy and, therefore, carried qualified recruits over to the next Academy.

The Police Department continues to experience successes with recruiting efforts and can confidently state that SJPD is continuing to rise. During the time period covered in this semi-annual report (April 1, 2018 to September 30, 2018), 55 new recruits joined the San José Police Department (June 2018 Academy) and will graduate in December 2018. Additionally, seven laterals have been hired from other agencies. In a strong sign of confidence in the Department, seven rehires have rejoined the ranks of the SJPD, with four more who have final offer letters starting just after this reporting period.

The Police Department plans to continue aggressive recruiting efforts in 2018-2019 to ensure ground is not lost, as many long-term members of the Department are eligible to retire over the next year.

In addition to relaying the success of the Department's efforts, this semi-annual report responds to the Council direction of December 2015 with detailed information about recruitment efforts from April 1, 2018 through the September 30, 2018. The Department's responses are provided below:

a. Funds expended to date in recruiting and hiring, and the uses of funds.

For the last quarter of 2017-2018 (April through June 2018), the Recruiting Unit's allocation was \$693,000, with expenditures and commitments for this reporting period totaling \$826,000 (Note: these funds represent only Recruiting Unit expenditures; the costs of the Background Unit are not included). The Recruiting Unit's expenditures did exceed its allocations at year end; however, these costs were absorbed within the Department's overall budget given the high

² PSFSS report: http://sanJosé.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php?meta_icN597039

³ PSFSS report: http://sanJosé.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php?meta_icN628749

⁴ PSFSS report: http://sanJosé.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php?meta_id=670201

⁵ PSFSS report: <http://sanJosé.legistar.com/gateway.aspx?M=F&ID=ef409ecf-af5a-4eaa-b223-e427e258fcb7.pdf>

October 10, 2018

Subject: Police Department Recruitment Activity Semi-Annual Report

Page 3

priority to quickly rebuild the sworn staffing levels while recruits' interests are high. The Department received an adjustment as part of the 2017-2018 Year End Clean Up actions to avoid an overage. One of the cost drivers during this reporting period was overtime of \$118,000 (a decrease compared to previous quarters).

For the first quarter of 2018-2019 (July through September 2018), the Recruiting Unit's allocation was \$682,000, with expenditures and commitments for this reporting period totaling \$704,000 (Note: these funds represent only Recruiting Unit expenditures; the costs of the Background Unit are not included). During this reporting period, overtime costs continued to decrease, totaling \$112,000. Personnel costs were higher in August due to the three pay periods in the month.

At the end of 2017-2018, the Department reached its goal for applicants in the background process for the October 2018 Academy and temporarily suspended most recruiting overtime. In July, the use of overtime resumed to recruit for the February 2019 Academy; overtime assignments focused on events that yield the highest likelihood of successful applications.

By year's end, the Recruiting Unit's expenditures are projected to exceed its allocations; however, it is also projected that the rate of spending will continue to decline in calendar year 2019, as newly graduated recruits replace current sworn vacancies during the rebuilding process. The Department will continue to monitor spending in context of its overall budget.

Overtime expenses fund attendance at job fairs and career days, as well as staff the written and oral board testing processes that are critical to the on-going recruiting requirements for the Department. As discussed at the previous Public Safety, Finance, and Strategic Support meeting, the National Testing Network (NTN), is now providing testing at various locations in California and throughout the United States; this has reduced overtime costs for the written test component of the recruitment process.

The Department has implemented a pilot phase using a video oral board test, where the applicant is video recorded and a review of the video is later conducted by staff. The Department has found that video oral boards reduce overtime needs significantly. For example, the Recruiting Team went to the New York area and conducted "All-in-One Testing." This resulted in 130 applicants being video recorded and the videos graded back in San José. The video oral board pilot saved significant travel and personnel costs, as the Department did not need to send a separate set of teams (generally six people) to New York to conduct oral board testing. The pilot also saved overtime costs as one to two teams in San José were able to review the 130 videos, rather than holding an entire day of testing that 130 applicants would normally require. Additionally, the video oral board process saves out of state applicants significant costs, as they do not have to travel to San José for this portion of the process. Staff believes using video oral boards has helped the Department find strong candidates who want to serve our community as police officers.

Staffing within the Recruiting Unit is minimal. The Department has reduced administrative staffing to one person and has four officers and a sergeant assigned as permanent staff. The Department continues to utilize the satellite recruiting program, where officers from throughout the Department assist in recruiting efforts at special events and job fairs on overtime assignments.

- b. The nature, intended audiences, and outcomes of various communication and marketing activities such as, but not limited to, advertising on radio, billboards, signage on city owned vehicles, and other advertising.

The Department's contracted professional marketing firm, Civilian, Inc., conducted another advertising effort for the Department's recruiting campaign during this timeframe (April – September). The firm's main marketing objectives were to rebuild the Department by finding and retaining highly-qualified candidates and to increase recruitment efficiency and effectiveness at a sustainable budget level. The campaign strategy is designed to reach audiences representing the diversity of San José's residents, women, military, college students, and police officers employed at other agencies. This strategy includes the use of social media tools (advertising through Indeed, Facebook, Google) and using programmatic display tactics (banners).

The results of using Civilian, Inc. continue to be impressive. The campaign exceeded its targeted goal of 600 applications, bringing the Department a total of 818 applications during this period. While the industry standard for online advertising efforts is an average click-through rate of 1 percent, the campaign with Civilian, Inc. achieved a 2.83 percent click-through rate.

The Recruiting Unit continues to partner with Civilian, Inc. to heavily recruit on specific online forums that have shown strong success in leading to applications. One strategy is to focus social media efforts on specific events, such as the upcoming recruiting trip to New York. The social media push will notify potential applicants that we are coming and things they can do to prepare for our visit. The Department partners with willing venues, like colleges, which post SJPd events on their social media and allow applicants to sign up and plan for the visit.

- c. Use and analysis of data identifying those specific marketing and outreach activities that yield the best results, and to assess optimal marginal allocation of future resources.

During this reporting period, the campaign resulted in more than 3,784 applications. The cost per application decreased by 57 percent, when compared to the initial cost per applications, making this the lowest cost tracked. As the consultant and the Recruiting Unit learn from each campaign or activity, strategies and tactics are redirected to the best key-performer digital marketing tools. The goal is to reach the highest numbers of individuals within the target audiences. To do so, the campaign uses location-based, Geo-fence technology (virtual geographic boundaries using GPS data) and optimizes outreach to military bases, universities/athletic teams, audiences engaged with prospecting efforts, job seekers using social media, and other law enforcement-related agencies.

- d. Data describing measurements of results specific to the ethnic and gender make-up of sub-categories of academy entrants.

As reported in the 2017 study of the SJPd's pedestrian and vehicle stop demographics by the University of Texas El Paso,⁶ SJPd's sworn staff is diverse: 53 percent of officers are White, 23

⁶ UTEP Analysis of SJPd Limited Detention Data: http://www.sjpd.org/Records/UTEP-SJPd_Traffic-Pedestrian_Stop_Study_2017.pdf

October 10, 2018

Subject: Police Department Recruitment Activity Semi-Annual Report

Page 5

percent are Hispanic, 11 percent are Asian, and 4 percent are Black. By comparison, San José residents are 43 percent White, 33 percent Hispanic, 32 percent Asian, and 3.2 percent Black.

The following chart provides a percentage breakdown by ethnicity and gender for the 106 Police Recruit/Officer hires joining the Department during the reporting period of April 1, 2018 through September 30, 2018:

Demographics of New Police Recruit/Officer Hires		
October 1, 2017 – March 31, 2018		
Demographic	Voluntary Self-Identification	Percentage
Gender	Female (+4%)	16%
	Male (-4%)	84%
	Undisclosed	0%
Ethnicity	American Indian / Alaskan Native (-1%)	0%
	Asian/Pacific Islander (+7%)	16%
	Black (+1%)	3%
	Hispanic / Latino (-3%)	23%
	White (+11%)	37%
	Undisclosed (-15%)	21%

Source: City of San José Human Resources provided 09/17/18

On October 22, 2018, Academy class 34 will begin. The following is a breakdown of the demographics: Female 13%, Male 87%, Asian / Pacific Islander 21%, Black 18%, Hispanic / Latino 29%, and White 21%. The diversity of this class is a strong reflection of our Recruiting Unit's efforts both locally and across the country.

The Department continues to find itself somewhat limited in the ability to provide measurements of results specific to the ethnicity of newly hired recruits/officers, when such disclosure is voluntary. During this reporting period, 21 percent of the recruits/officers hired chose not to disclose their voluntary self-identification.

The Recruiting Unit continues to actively seek-out community events to reach the highest numbers of qualified and diverse candidates through known and traditional methods, including attending job fairs, veterans' events, and community/cultural festivals.

The following is a chart containing some of the events attended by recruiting officers during this reporting period:

San Diego Testing	Monterey Academy
PelletB Tests- Substation	All-In-One Testing Weekends
Evergreen Valley College Job Fair	Boot Camp Series
Atlanta Georgia Testing	Juneteenth Recruiting Booth
WSTB (Physical Agility) – Monterey	The Fit Expo – San José

October 10, 2018

Subject: Police Department Recruitment Activity Semi-Annual Report

Page 6

WSTB (Physical Agility) – San Mateo	Marine Corps Family Day
National Night Out	Assyrian Festival
Italian Festival	San José Pride Festival
Boba With A Cop	Diversity Employment Day- Oakland
San José State University Job Fair	SJSU Football Collaboration
PelletB Workshops	University of Reno (UNR) Recruiting
Ohlone College Career Fair	Hartnell College Career Fair
Sacramento State Career Fair	SJSU Softball Recruiting Event
Univ. of Reno Criminal Justice Program	

e. Data describing the reasons officers are resigning from the Department (e.g., retirement, moving to another city department, resignation in lieu of termination, etc.).

During the exit interview process, officers have the option to voluntarily note in their Notice of Separation form, their reason(s) for resigning from the Department.

During this reporting period, 39 officers separated from the City:

SWORN SEPARATIONS
April 1, 2018 – September 30, 2018

Status	Type	Apr-18	May-18	Jun-18	Jul-18	Aug-18	Sep-18	Total
Resignation	In-Lieu of Termination		3	2			1	6
	Other Agency	3	1	1				5
	Personal	1	3	3	1	3		11
Retirement	Service	2	2	3	1		2	10
	Service Disability	1	1				1	3
	Non Service Disability		1					1
Termination	Termination	1					1	2
Transfer	Transfer to CSO						1	1
Grand Total		8	11	9	2	3	6	39

f. The status of efforts to boost applications and hiring of women, veterans, and a diverse applicant pool by re-focusing marketing, as suggested above.

The Department continues to seek ways to enhance recruiting efforts and expand the hiring of qualified candidates. As an example, the Department has met with various affinity groups throughout the country and is in the process of developing an expanded social media strategy to promote job openings to them. This project will increase national presence and outreach capabilities beyond what the small recruiting team can do in person. By measuring response from these efforts, the Department can determine where personal appearances will generate large numbers of qualified recruits.

The Department continues to accept the National Testing Network (NTN) written test as an acceptable form of testing. Due to its convenience, this test is most highly used by out-of-state applicants. Staff is now working with the Police Department's Communications Division to determine if this process will assist them in their recruiting efforts. NTN has 12 centers in California and 29 centers throughout the country. NTN also offers practice tests to candidates; staff has found that potential candidates who pass a practice test are more likely to travel to San José for one of the Department's "all-in-one" testing weekends. This change has significantly reduced overtime expenditures on the testing phase of the recruitment process and has enabled the Department to work with more applicants from across the country, in a way that is more manageable for the applicants' schedules and budgets.

Other ongoing recruiting efforts include:

- Hosting two Career Day seminars annually;
- Providing free testing workshops to aid potential applicants through the testing process:
 - WSTB (Physical Agility) workshop
 - WSTB Women's Practice
 - PELLETB (Written) workshops
 - Oral Board Interview workshops
 - Scheduling "Ride-Alongs" for applicants
 - Women's Boot Camp
- Providing "All-in-One" testing to out-of-state locations;
- Providing one-on-one mentoring;
- Continuing to seek activities / venues / new methods to reach intended audiences; and
- Continuing to partner with community leaders and members of the community.

Staff continually analyzes the success of these events. In 2018-2019, the Recruiting Unit will host one Career Day for a large-scale audience and hold a specific Women's Career Day in 2019; both events require significant overtime from personnel throughout the Department. While the Women's Career Day has been successful in attracting applicants for sworn and civilian positions, the SJPD Career Day has yielded a lower return on investment. Moving forward, the structure of the SJPD Career Day event has been changed, in an effort to attract more applicants and provide more resources for future police recruits.

Communications Division Recruiting Efforts

The Communications Division consists of Public Safety Communications Specialists (PSCS), who are the first interface when a resident calls 9-1-1, and Public Safety Radio Dispatchers (PSRD), who dispatch officers and communicate with them in the field. As reported to PSFSS on February 15, 2018, recruiting and retention for dispatchers is an issue in San José, as well as throughout the State of California. The Communications Division currently has 24 vacancies total in Public Safety Radio Dispatchers (PSRD) and Public Safety Communications Specialists (PSCS).

Currently, four students are in the Basic Academy that started in August 2018, with a graduation date of October 19, 2018. As far as attrition, the Division lost ten employees during this

timeframe due to resignations, taking other City positions, and service retirements. From April 1, 2018 through September 30, 2018, the Communications Division hired 12 new employees; this brought the number of vacancies as of September 30th to 4.5 in the PSCS rank and 19.5 in the PSRD rank, which is equivalent to approximately 59% of PSRD's Control Room-ready.

Recruitment efforts are critical. Job openings are posted on the websites for CALNENA (California National Emergency Number Association) and State of California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST), in addition to the City of San José jobs website and the Police Department's recruiting website (which is currently in the process of being updated).

The Recruiting Unit and Communications are working on new display and social media advertisements featuring Communications opportunities. The Department's video unit is working with Communications to create features on the Communications Center and opportunities in the Division.

At all recruiting events, the Police Department's Recruiting Unit provides Communications Division flyers to interested applicants; these flyers give information about the PSCS and PSRD positions, including job duties, minimum requirements, salary and benefits, how to apply, and FAQs. A "SJPD Communications Interest Form" is available for applicants to sign-up for additional information. These are then routed to a Communications recruiter.

During the Women's Career Day seminars and SJPD Career Day events, Communications personnel participate in panel discussions and hold break-out sessions, where they give presentations, meet with attendees, and answer questions.

The Communications Division recruiters attend the Police Department recruitment events whenever possible. Additionally, they go out to local Community Colleges, post recruitment flyers, and meet with staff. Staff from Communications recruits at the Department's "Coffee/Boba with a Cop" events and attends community events with Crime Prevention staff.

The contract with Civilian, Inc. has now expanded to include providing more exposure and community awareness of the opportunities available in the San José Police Department Communication Division and the benefits of joining the team.

CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS

In the year ahead, the City and the Department will continue to look for ways to expand the hiring of qualified candidates. Staff will continue to work to reach our intended audiences, with a goal of providing opportunities to learn about the Department and the value of police work, as well as the reward of providing public service to this City and its residents.

October 10, 2018

Subject: Police Department Recruitment Activity Semi-Annual Report

Page 9

COORDINATION

This memorandum has been coordinated with the City Attorney's Office, Human Resources Department, Office of Employee Relations, and the City Manager's Budget Office.

/s/

Edgardo Garcia
Chief of Police

For questions please contact Todd Trayer, Lieutenant, at (408) 537-9883.