PSFSS COMMITTEE: 04/19/18 ITEM: (d) 2



Memorandum

## TO: PUBLIC SAFETY, FINANCE, AND STRATEGIC SUPPORT COMMITTEE

**FROM:** Edgardo Garcia Chief of Police

SUBJECT: POLICE DEPARTMENT RECRUITMENT ACTIVITY SEMI-ANNUAL REPORT DATE: April 9, 2018

Approved Date 4-11-18 RECOMMENDATION

Accept the semi-annual report on Police Department recruitment activity, including recruiting and hiring expenditures, communication/marketing activities, marketing and outreach data analysis, academy entrants' data analysis, officer resignation data analysis, and diverse applicant pool applications/hiring efforts.

# BACKGROUND

On December 1, 2015, as part of their review of the Police Department Hiring Audit, the City Council directed the City Manager to report to the Public Safety, Finance, and Strategic Support Committee on the Police Academy recruitment cycle with a Recruitment Activity Report, beginning in spring 2016. The report was to include the following:

- a. Funds expended to date in recruiting and hiring, and the uses of funds;
- b. The nature, intended audiences, and outcomes of various communication and marketing activities such as, but not limited to, advertising on radio, billboards, signage on city owned vehicles, and other advertising;
- c. Use and analysis of data identifying those specific marketing and outreach activities that yield the best results, and to assess optimal marginal allocation of future resources;
- d. Data describing measurements of results specific to the ethnic and gender make-up of sub-categories of academy entrants;
- e. Data describing the reasons officers are resigning from the Department (e.g., retirement, moving to another city department, resignation in lieu of termination, etc.); and
- f. The status of efforts to boost applications and hiring of women, veterans, and a diverse applicant pool by re-focusing marketing, as suggested above.

On October 4, 2016, the City Council heard and accepted a special report, "Police Department Staffing and Discussion of Options to Address the Unprecedented Low Staffing Levels in the Patrol Division,"<sup>1</sup> which included a detailed overview of the Department's police officer recruiting efforts. Subsequently, the Police Department provided semi-annual reports on police

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Council report: http://saniose.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php7view id=&event id=2156&meta id=594329

officer recruitment activity to the PSFSS Committee on October 20, 2016<sup>2</sup>, April 20, 2017<sup>3</sup>, and October 19, 2017.<sup>4</sup>

As recommended by the Public Safety, Finance, and Strategic Support Committee on February 15, 2018, the Department has now included a new section to this report to provide additional information on recruiting and outreach efforts to fill Public Safety Communications Specialist and Public Safety Radio Dispatcher positions in the Communications Division.

## ANALYSIS

The San José Police Department Recruiting Unit currently accepts police officer applications year-round and holds three academies per fiscal year: October, February, and June. The recruiting cycle is approximately four months per academy; however, the timeline for each recruit may vary from four to nine months from application to enrollment in the academy, depending on when in the cycle a recruit applies.

The Police Department has seen major success from recent recruiting efforts, and can confidently state that SJPD is rising. During the October 1, 2017 to March 31, 2018 time period covered in this semi-annual report, 106 new recruits joined the San José Police Department with 53 recruits hired for Academy 31 (October 2017) and Academy 32 (February 2018).

Additionally, seven laterals have been hired from other agencies (this number includes four laterals who have been given a Final Offer of Employment, but will join the Department on April 23). And, in a strong sign of confidence in the Department, 14 rehires have rejoined the ranks of the SJPD.

The Police Department plans to continue aggressive recruiting efforts in 2018-2019 to ensure that ground is not lost as many long-term members of the Department are slated to retire in the next few years.

In addition to relaying the success of the Department's efforts, this semi-annual report responds to the Council direction of December 2015 with detailed information about recruitment efforts from October 1, 2017, through the March 31, 2018. The Department's responses are provided below:

## a. Funds expended to date in recruiting and hiring, and the uses of funds.

For the second and third quarter of 2017-2018 (October 2017 through March 2018), the Recruiting Unit's allocation was \$1.2 million, with expenditures and commitments for this reporting period totaling \$1.6 million. (Note: these funds represent only Recruiting Unit expenditures; the costs of the Background Unit are not included).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> PSFSS report: http://sanjose.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php7meta\_icN597039

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> PSFSS report: http://sanjose.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php7meta icN628749

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> PSFSS report: http://sanjose.granicus.com/MetaViewer.php?meta\_id=670201PS

March 2018 expenses included three pay periods. By the year's end, the Recruiting Unit's expenditures are projected to exceed its allocation. The Department will continue to monitor spending in context of its overall budget and any overages will be absorbed by other budgetary savings in the department or through a year-end budget clean-up action.

The primary cost driver during this reporting period are overtime expenses of \$564,000, which goes toward attendance at job fairs, Career Days, and other recruiting events, as well as staffing the written and oral boards testing processes. As discussed later in this memorandum, the Department is taking a new approach to written testing by contracting with National Testing Network (NTN), which will now provide testing at various locations in California and the United States. This will reduce overtime costs for the written test component of the recruitment process.

In addition, the Department is exploring the potential of using video oral board testing, in which the applicant is video recorded, then review and testing is conducted at a later date. Staff would begin with testing this first before moving forward, and if successful, such a change could reduce recruitment overtime spending by an estimated 30 percent to 40 percent.

The Department has suspended most recruiting overtime through the end of the 2017-2018 fiscal year as the Department has reached its goal for applicants in the background process for the October 2018 Academy. Recruiting efforts for the February 2019 Academy will resume in July, however staff is removing more than half of the scheduled recruiting overtime assignments, particularly those that have yielded few applicants.

b. <u>The nature, intended audiences, and outcomes of various communication and marketing</u> <u>activities such as, but not limited to, advertising on radio, billboards, signage on city owned</u> <u>vehicles, and other advertising.</u>

The Department's contracted professional marketing firm, Civilian, Inc., conducted Phase 2 of the Department's recruiting campaign, with the main marketing objectives of finding and retaining highly-qualified candidates, and rebuilding the police force by increasing recruitment efficiency at a sustainable budget level. The campaign strategy is designed to reach audiences representing the diversity of San José's residents, women, military, college students and police officers. This strategy includes the use of social media tools such as advertising through Indeed, Facebook, Google, and using programmatic display tactics (banners).

## c. <u>Use and analysis of data identifying those specific marketing and outreach activities that yield</u> the best results, and to assess optimal marginal allocation of future resources.

During this reporting period, the campaign resulted in more than 1,700 applications, with the cost per application decreasing by 46 percent when compared to the previous campaign. As the consultant and the Recruiting Unit learn from each campaign or activity, strategies and tactics are redirected to the best key-performer digital marketing tools. The goal is to reach the highest numbers of individuals within the target audiences. To do so, the campaign uses location-based, Geo-fence technology (virtual geographic boundaries using GPS data) and optimizes outreach to military bases, universities, audiences engaged with prospecting efforts, job seekers using social media, and other law enforcement-related agencies.

# d. <u>Data describing measurements of results specific to the ethnic and gender make-up of sub-</u> categories of academy entrants.

As reported in the 2017 study of the SJPD's pedestrian and vehicle stop demographics by the University of Texas El Paso,<sup>5</sup> SJPD's sworn staff is diverse: 53 percent of officers are White, 23 percent are Hispanic, 11 percent are Asian, and 4 percent are Black. By comparison, San José residents are 43 percent White, 33 percent Hispanic, 32 percent Asian, and 3.2 percent Black.

The following chart provides a percentage breakdown by ethnicity and gender for the 106 Police Recruit/Officer hires joining the Department during the reporting period of October 1, 2017, through March 31, 2018:

Demographic	October 1, 2017 – March 31, 2018 Voluntary Self-Identification	Percentage		
Gender	Female	12%		
	Male	88%		
	Undisclosed	0%		
Ethnicity	American Indian / Alaskan Native Asian/Pacific Islander	1%		
	Black	2%		
	Hispanic / Latino	26%		
	White	26%		
	Undisclosed	36%		

Source: City of San José Human Resources

It should be noted the Department finds itself somewhat limited in the ability to provide measurements of results specific to the ethnicity of newly hired recruits/officers, when such disclosure is voluntary. During this reporting period, 36 percent of the recruit/officers hired chose not to disclose their voluntary self-identification.

The Recruiting Unit will continue to actively seek-out community events to reach the highest numbers of qualified and diverse candidates through known and traditional methods, such as attending job fairs, veterans' events, and community/cultural festivals.

Some of the events attended by recruiting officers during this reporting period include:

Aki Matsuri Festival	USC Diversity & Inclusion Recruiting			
NBC Día de Los Muertos Festival	Black College Expo			
Milpitas Mid-Autumn Festival	Gavilan College Career Fair			
Salsa Festival	Recruit Military Career Fair SJ			
SJSU Stay Woke and Wake Up	Job Fest Career Fair USF			
Golden Gate Half Expo	Spartan Race San José			
Bay Area Hmong New Year Festival	CSUSB Law Enforcement Career Fair			
Nellis Air Show	Sonoma State Career Fair			
Veterans Day Parade	UC Merced Career Fair			
SJ TET Festival	Recruit Military San Diego			
SJPD Women's Career Day	Cal Maritime Career Fair			
SJPD Career Day	29 Palms Career Fair			

e. <u>Data describing the reasons officers are resigning from the Department (e.g., retirement,</u> moving to another city department, resignation in lieu of termination, etc.).

During the exit interview process, officers have the option to voluntarily note in their Notice of Separation form, their reason(s) for resigning from the Department.

During this reporting period, 47 officers separated from the City:

Status	Туре	Oct-17	Nov-17	Dec-17	Jan-18	Feb-18	Mar-18	Total
Resignation	Defer Vested			1				1
	In-Lieu of Termination	3		1	1		3	8
	Other Agency	1			1			2
	Personal			2	2	4		8
Retirement	Service	1	1	5	10		3	20
Termination	Termination	1	2	1				4
Transfer	Transfer to CSO	1	1	1				3
	Schooling					1		1
Grand Total	- Province Strengt	7	4	11	14	5	6	47

# SWORN SEPARATIONS

## f. <u>The status of efforts to boost applications and hiring of women, veterans, and a diverse</u> <u>applicant pool by re-focusing marketing, as suggested above.</u>

The Department will continue to seek ways to enhance recruiting efforts and expand the hiring of qualified candidates. As an example, beginning in January 2018, the Department began accepting written examination scores from the National Testing Network (NTN). By offering an alternative method to meet the written examination requirement, local and out-of-area candidates can now choose to take the exam at a date, time, and location convenient to their schedule. This is particularly important for out-of-state/out-of-area candidates, who have the option to take the NTN written test prior to travelling to San José for the "All-in-One" weekend of testing. With more than 12 testing centers located in California alone (four locally) and locations in 29 other states across the nation, a candidate can register and take the written examination close to home. Additionally, should a candidate receive a failing grade, they can retake the test after three months, giving them an additional opportunity to succeed in the written testing phase. Potential candidates can also take advantage of the on-line practice tests offered by the NTN. As mentioned above, this change is anticipated to save overtime costs, as well as offer convenience to the potential recruits.

Other recruiting activities during the October 1, 2017-March 31, 2018 time period included the following efforts focused on growing the applicant pool:

- Hosting two annual Women's Career Day seminars;
- Hosting two annual SJPD Career Days;
- Providing free testing workshops to aid potential applicants through the testing process:
  - o WSTB (Physical Agility) workshop
  - o WSTB Women's Practice
  - PELLETB (Written) workshops
  - o Oral Board Interview workshops
  - o Scheduling "Ride-Alongs" for applicants
  - o Women's Boot Camp
- Providing "All-in-One" testing to out-of-state locations;
- Providing one-on-one mentoring;
- Continuing to seek activities / venues / new methods to reach intended audiences; and
- Continuing to partner with community leaders and members of the community.

Staff continually analyzes the success of these events. In 2018-2019, the Recruiting Unit will host one Women's Career Day and eliminate the SJPD Career Day. Both events require significant overtime from personnel throughout the Department, and while the Women's Career Day has been successful in attracting applicants for sworn and civilian positions, the SJPD Career Day has yielded a relatively low return on investment for the time and energy required to host the event.

### **Communications Division Recruiting Efforts**

The Communications Division consists of non-sworn Public Safety Communications Specialists (PSCS), who are the first interface when a resident calls 9-1-1, and Public Safety Radio Dispatchers (PSRD) who communicate with and dispatch officers in the field, providing critical emergency information. As reported to PSFSS in the February 15, 2018 Police Department Operations and Performance Bi-monthly Report, recruiting and retention for dispatchers is an issue not only for San José, but throughout the State of California. The San José Fire Department reports challenges with recruitment and vacancies as well.

From October 1, 2017 through March 31, 2018, the Communications Division hired nine new employees. However, it must be noted that during that same time frame, the division lost eight employees (three became police officers, one retired, one left to pursue another career, one was terminated, and two probationary employees were released for failure to pass training).

As of April 9, 2018, the Division has hired eight new employees and had one return from leave, so the team currently has no vacancies in the PSCS rank. Unfortunately, there are 18 vacancies in the PSRD rank (with an additional 15 dispatchers in various stages of training), which leaves the Communications Division with only 59 percent of Control Room-ready PSRDs.

To that end, recruitment efforts are critical. Job openings are posted on the websites for CALNENA (California National Emergency Number Association) and State of California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST), in addition to the City of San José jobs website and the Police Department's recruiting website (which is currently being updated).

The Recruiting Unit and Communications are working on new display and social media advertisements featuring Communications opportunities, and social media spots are scheduled to begin in June 2018. The Department's video unit is working with Communications to create features on the Communications Center and opportunities in the Division.

On February 16, 2018, on the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of America's first 9-1-1 call, the City Manager's Office and the Police and Fire Chiefs said a special "thank you" to San José Police and Fire Communications staff. A birthday cake and treats were provided by AT&T, and several Councilmembers and the media were in attendance, helping to tell the story of the need for calltakers and dispatchers with the larger community.

With respect to recruiting events, at all events, the Police Department Recruiting Unit provides Communications Division flyers to interested applicants, which give information about the PSCS and PSRD positions, including job duties, minimum requirements, salary and benefits, how to apply, and FAQs. Additionally, a "SJPD Communications Interest Form" is available for applicants to sign-up for additional information. These are then routed to a Communications recruiter.

During the Women's Career Day seminars and SJPD Career Day events, Communications personnel have participated in panel discussions and hold break-out sessions, where they have given presentations and been available to meet with attendees and answer any questions a potential applicant may have.

The Communications Division recruiters attend the Police Department recruitment events whenever possible. In addition, when staff is able, they go out to local Community Colleges, post recruitment flyers, and meet with staff. Staff from Communications also does recruiting at the Department's Coffee with a Cop events and attend community events with Crime Prevention staff, which has brought in a few applicants as well.

## CONCLUSION/NEXT STEPS

In the year ahead, the City and the Department will continue to look for ways to expand the hiring of qualified candidates. Staff will continue to work to reach our intended audiences, with a goal of providing opportunities to learn about the Department and the value of police work, as well as the reward of providing public service to this City and its residents.

### COORDINATION

This memorandum has been coordinated with the City Attorney's Office, Human Resources Department, Office of Employee Relations, and the City Manager's Budget Office.

/s/ Edgardo Garcia Chief of Police

For questions please contact Heather Randol, Acting Captain, at (408) 537-9852.