



Memorandum

TO: SMART CITIES AND SERVICE
IMPROVEMENTS COMMITTEE

FROM: Matt Cano
Khaled Tawfik

**SUBJECT: DIGITAL PUBLIC MEETING
IMPROVEMENTS STATUS REPORT**

DATE: August 22, 2022

Approved 

Date August 23, 2022

RECOMMENDATION

Accept the status report on digital public meeting improvements, including projects to modernize meeting spaces, audio-visual systems, and broadcasting to enhance public meetings and hybrid participation by in-person and remote attendees.

OUTCOME

The Committee will provide feedback on digital public meeting improvements, including the City's use of streaming services to support public engagement, agenda management and access, meeting management tools, and audiovisual equipment capital improvements in the City Council Chambers, Committee Rooms, and City Hall Conference Rooms.

BACKGROUND

Public meeting agenda development and publication, meeting management, and broadcasting meetings via the internet and cable television are core local government functions that support presenting staff work for action by Mayor and City Council. This includes important aspects of public participation in City Council deliberations and decision-making that affects the San José community.

The City Clerk and City Manager's Office jointly manage agenda development for City of San José public meetings. Across City Council, Council Committees, and over thirty active Boards, Committees, and Commissions, 20 to 50 City employees participate in planning, publishing, running, and completing records for about 40 meetings per month.

CivicCenter Television manages the broadcast of public meetings to the City's cable television channel and internet, live streaming over 235 public meetings in a year. The City is currently

using solutions provided by Granicus, Inc., to deliver most of these functions. Examples of these solutions can be found at:

- MediaManager: https://sanjose.granicus.com/ViewPublisher.php?view_id=51
- Legistar: <https://sanjose.legistar.com>
- Boards and Commissions: <https://sanjose.granicus.com/boards/w/2f8403d8c84ae3fe>
- eComment: <https://sanjose.granicusideas.com/meetings>

In addition to Granicus products, the City Clerk utilizes VoteLynx for in-meeting vote management, and CivicCenter Television uses video encoding hardware to live stream meetings to the City's YouTube channel¹. The audio-visual and voting system are maintained by the Department of Public Works, including equipment and software.

Since 2005, following a competitive procurement, the City has maintained an agreement with Granicus for agenda and meeting management tools in addition to web-streaming of sessions and hosting recorded videos for public access. Council subsequently approved four amendments to the agreement to add features to improve meeting management and broadcasting including: legislative process automation, a public body management software module, mobile agenda viewing, and a public agenda comment tool. On June 8, 2021, the agreement was amended to allow extensions through August 8, 2025. Upon extension of the agreement, City staff were directed by City Council to report back to Smart Cities and Service Improvements Committee with analysis of the following²:

- (1) Solicit from the Mayor's Office, Council Offices, and other relevant stakeholders their requests for service improvements related to the streaming and agenda management tools currently provided.
- (2) Assess, in particular, the value of the streaming services provided by Granicus, Inc. in light of the tools available via Zoom, YouTube, and other potential service providers.
- (3) Provide an update including, but not limited to, requested service improvements, the assessment of streaming services, and staff's recommended approach to improving these services through a future request for proposal and/or amendments to existing contracts.

With lessons from the COVID-19 pandemic, City Council expressed a clear desire to ensure public meeting technology solutions are in place that support hybrid meetings—both in-person and videoconference attendance among the public, staff, and Councilmembers—for City Council, Council Committee, Commission, and Board meetings moving forward.

¹ San Jose YouTube channel— www.youtube.com/cityofsanjosecalifornia

² 6/8/2021 City Council Meeting, Amendment to the Agreement with Granicus, Inc. for Web-streaming Software and Hosting Services— <https://sanjose.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4964339&GUID=F2C43328-BE6F-42B9-9474-FA3B667F224C&Options=&Search=>

Stakeholders Input for Service Improvements

The Mayor and City Council, City Clerk, and City Manager—Agenda Services teams identified the following features for improved agenda and meeting management:

- More intuitive software to ease and minimize training of new staff;
- Mobile application that effectively synchs across tablet and phone devices with high stability;
- Easy to use process for City residents;
- Ability for staff to easily create and make edits of agenda templates;
- Convenient way to manage markups of agendas and to add notes with many contributors;
- Ability to automatically post agenda to Brown Act site without delay or lag;
- Central location and visibility of all agendas;
- Ability to include e-comments for the public—when receiving a large amount of e-comments, displayed to those running the meeting and the public;
- Options to send notifications to people enrolling to receive updates immediately, daily, and weekly;
- Options for viewing agenda documents in a new browser tab in current/supported browsers (e.g., Chrome, Firefox, Edge, Safari) rather than as direct downloads that users can miss.

The training required to develop proficiency with the software used is especially important, as many staff play a role in agenda development and meeting management. Software that provides an intuitive and effective workflow, templates, and easy adoption allows departments and Council Appointee offices to effectively run meetings that engage the audience with fewer issues.

Value of Streaming Services—Broadcasting and Hosting

To assess value and compare current streaming services in light of the tools available via Zoom, YouTube, and other potential service providers, it is important to clarify what software components are used in broadcasting and access to videos of past meetings.

- Granicus is an enterprise provider of software and hardware solutions for government and one of the largest companies in this software segment. Granicus provides an end-to-end streaming video solution from event scheduling, encoding hardware and software, video hosting and management, custom video player page, streaming video chaptering (agenda linking), and hosting page links to documents such as agendas, memorandums, and presentations.
- Zoom is a video communications provider that permits physically separated individuals to talk to each other in real time using high-fidelity audio and video over the internet. Zoom has the capability to stream directly to YouTube and Facebook, leading public meeting features, along with a growing number of language support and closed-captioning accessibility features.

- YouTube is a free video sharing and social media website that allows individuals and organizations to share live-streamed and on-demand videos with tools that manage scheduling and hosting streamed events.

City staff's analysis of other service providers does not include Zoom and YouTube, as they are not equivalent services for managing legislative meeting facilities. Rather, Zoom and YouTube remain essential components of the City's overall integrated public meeting technology, adding essential levels of engagement and accessibility for the public audience.

Within the topic of streaming and service providers, CivicCenter Television provides core transparency and public participation services for the community. As San José's government access channel, CivicCenter TV generates the broadcast that our streaming solutions webcast. State regulations (2006 AB 2987 DIVCA) impose a fee, 1% of revenue, on video service providers such as Comcast and AT&T, which is earmarked to support capital and maintenance of PEG (Public, Educational and Government) cable access broadcast facilities. CivicCenter Television's operational costs are funded by the General Fund and capital and maintenance expenses come from the Government Access Capital Fund. City staff will continue to operate and integrate this public resource with streaming solutions.

The audiovisual equipment currently installed in the City Council Chambers and Committee Rooms is far beyond the end of its engineered life, with several original components in place since City Hall opened in 2005. Although upgrade work has occurred over the last five years, the overall system is aged, with frequent technical issues experienced during live public meetings and software applications that are often incompatible with newer operating systems. As with any technology-based equipment that has been in use for the last 17 years, a full overhaul of the system is warranted to ensure consistent reliability and full capability to host hybrid format public meetings and increased public demand post-COVID-19 pandemic.

Additionally, many of the conference rooms at City Hall have recently been equipped with audiovisual equipment to more effectively host hybrid meetings between staff, other agencies, contractors, consultants, or members of the public. In order to effectively facilitate such meetings in the newer format, the conference rooms were outfitted with monitors, cameras, microphones, and speaker systems.

ANALYSIS

In January 2021, the County of Santa Clara (County) issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) for a commercial-off-the-shelf software as a service agenda and meeting management solution to assist its Clerk of the Board of Supervisors, Board of Supervisors, and staff with needs matching the City's. Their staff identified requirements of preparing and submitting agenda items, developing agendas, preparing minutes, processing approved documents and other records documenting Board actions, streaming videos of live and recorded meetings, and facilitating meeting management for all County meeting bodies. Through its RFP process, the County selected Prime Government Solutions, Inc., (PrimeGov) as the best value proposer and entered

into an agreement with PrimeGov in December 2021. City staff utilized the County selection method to expedite the procurement process. A summary of vendor capabilities were presented to the Smart Cities and Service Improvements Committee on December 2, 2021³.

In accordance with [San José Municipal Code Section 4.12.225](#)⁴, the City may purchase goods and services from vendors based on the results of competitive processes undertaken by other public agencies provided procurement processes are substantially similar to the City's procurement procedures and the City was either specifically or categorically noted as a third-party beneficiary of the competitive procurement. City staff reviewed the County's RFP, including the scope of work, and competitive processes, and concluded that the County's RFP comports with the City's Municipal Code requirement as a cooperative agreement. Staff entered into contract negotiations with the vendor in April 2022.

Summary of Proposed Agreement: Negotiations are in process with PrimeGov. Should any modifications to the City's standard terms and conditions arise, changes will be approved by the City Attorney's Office and City Manager's Office per City Policy. The agreement includes the following provisions:

- A detailed scope of work to ensure that the implemented solution complies with the City's requirements;
- A preliminary project implementation plan that meets the City's requirements for project completion;
- A compensation schedule that includes vendor payment after delivery and acceptance of project milestones and deliverables;
- Fixed pricing for the first five years of the agreement (initial term plus four options) agreement, with any vendor requests for adjustments after the fifth year justified in accordance with the Producer Price Index and limited to 3% over the previous year's fees unless otherwise negotiated; and
- Nine one-year options to extend the agreement for ongoing software licensing, technical support, maintenance, and other related services.

Cost & Schedule

The one-time implementation cost of the new PrimeGov technology will be \$89,980 (due in FY 2022-23), and the first annual recurring fee will be \$98,000 (due in FY 2023-24). Council approval will be required before the contract with PrimeGov is finalized and executed. The implementation of the software is anticipated to begin in October after the contract is executed and ends in May of 2023 – a nine (9) month timeframe. The deployment of the new software will be closely coordinated with the new audiovisual equipment in December 2022 to ensure that they are functional together with no errors at public meetings. Training of Council and City staff on use of the new public meeting systems is planned for June of 2023, before Council goes on break

³ 12/2/2021 Smart Cities and Service Improvements Committee Meeting, Digital Public Participation Status Report— <https://sanjose.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=5210556&GUID=1C9C074E-0FBA-44CE-AAC7-E609FA8CD5D8>

⁴ City of San José City Code on Purchasing— [Chapter 4.12 - PROCUREMENTS OF GOODS AND SERVICES](#)

in July 2023. The training will ensure that each department and office is familiar with the new system, and that prior data is effectively archived and stored.

Council Chambers and Committee Rooms Audiovisual System Capital Improvements

Staff completed an itemized review for each of the current audiovisual system components in the City Council Chambers and Committee Rooms. This assessment was critical in identifying the deficiencies of the infrastructure and to help strategize the best approach to design and integrate a new overhauled system. To help with the assessment and design work, Salas O'Brien was hired, along with their sub-consultants, Randon and the GIA Design Group. The scope of this project is to replace the existing customized voting system in the Council Chambers with a new all-in-one voting and presentation system, and to install a new portable system in the Council Committee Rooms. In addition, the audio systems in both the Council Chambers and the Committee Rooms will be upgraded as well due to their antiquated state.

Upon completion of the project scope of work, a competitive bid was released via Biddingo on February 2, 2022. Two bids were received on March 17, 2022, however, both were deemed not responsive or responsible due to multiple bid irregularities. As such, the project was re-bid on April 20, 2022, with a bid opening on June 2, 2022. Through the re-bid process, EIDIM has been selected and awarded the project contract for an amount not to exceed \$895,328.51 with a 15% contingency. The agreement is in the final execution process, and it is anticipated EIDIM will be given a notice to proceed with the project in late-August 2022.

With supply chain issues still a major challenge globally, the new audiovisual equipment is anticipated to take four to six months for delivery upon the date of order. The installation work is estimated at two months, with another two months needed for system testing and commissioning. Construction in the Council Chambers and Committee Room spaces are anticipated to begin in the winter to Spring months, with project completion estimated in Summer 2023. During the construction time, EIDIM will have access to the Council Chambers and Committee Rooms between Friday through Monday of each week (including weekends), thus allowing use of the rooms for public meetings between Tuesdays through Thursdays.

City Hall Conference Rooms Audiovisual System Equipment

Staff evaluated the City Hall conference rooms, assessed additional needs, and determined that to outfit the conference rooms accessible by the exterior lobby on each floor and a few key interior conference rooms was what could be accomplished in the allocated budget. The procurement of larger touchscreen display monitors, monitor stands, cameras, microphones, and speakers has been completed. Installation and integration began in July 2022, including testing the equipment in the City Manager's main conference room in August with the City Clerk and ITD successfully simulating a Council meeting in that space. Installation work in all identified rooms is estimated for completion in September 2022. Instructions to operate the new audiovisual equipment will be conducted by a combination of hands-on staff training, video tutorials, step-by-step directions

posted in each room, and QR code links for online information, along with staff support as needed.

CONCLUSION

The City's upgrade of its public meeting management system, audiovisual hardware equipment, and hybrid meeting capabilities will position the City to respond to the growing need for digital interaction with the public, allowing transparency, responsiveness, and enhanced engagement. Current equipment and software supporting public meetings is aged and requires a technical refresh to operate with current equipment and service providers. Working with the Finance Departments—Purchasing Division to use a cooperative procurement method, the City accelerated its public meetings technology refresh at advantageous cost.

Over the course of the next year, staff from the City Clerk's Office, City Manager's Office, Public Works Department, and Information Technology Department will work together to plan, time, and execute upgrades without interrupting the City's schedule of public meetings. Staffs will be trained and the new system should be operational at the start of Fiscal Year 2023-2024, barring any unmitigable supply chain or staffing delays. The new hardware and software will support the post-pandemic demands of the San Jose community and City staff.

EVALUATION AND FOLLOW-UP

City staff will negotiate the contract with PrimeGov and seek City Council approval at a coming meeting. Implementation of the new software is planned for by May 2023, in coordination with the new audiovisual equipment installations. The City Clerk's Office and City Manager's Office will coordinate any changes in funding requirements through the annual City Budget Process.

CLIMATE SMART SAN JOSE

The recommendation in this memo has no effect on Climate Smart San José energy or water goals but does impact mobility goals. Allowing the public to participate in public meetings without having to use transportation positively impacts mobility use and carbon emissions.

COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION/INPUT

This report was not presented at a Commission.

CEQA

Not a Project, File No. PP17-009, Staff Reports, Assessments, Annual Reports, and Informational Memos that involve no approvals of any City action. (Information Technology)

PUBLIC OUTREACH

This memorandum will be posted on the City's website for the September 1, 2022, Smart Cities and Service Improvements Committee meeting.

COORDINATION

This memorandum has been coordinated with the City Clerk's Office, the City Manager's Office, the Public Works Department, and the Information Technology Department.

/s/
MATT CANO
DIRECTOR
Public Works Department

/s/
KHALED TAWFIK
CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER
Information Technology Department

For questions on the improvements in the City Council Chambers and Committee Rooms, please contact Walter Lin, Deputy Public Works Director, at walter.lin@sanjoseca.gov, and for questions on the improvements in the City Hall conference rooms and meeting management tools, please contact Dhruv Hemmady, Products-Projects Manager, Information Technology Department, at dhruv.hemmady@sanjoseca.gov.