



Request for Policy Analysis (Council Referrals)

Department DOT/PRNS Rules Date May 15, 2024 Item C.2
 Department Rep. Name/Ext. Rick Scott/Andrea Flores-Shelton Councilmember Sponsorship Jimenez
 Policy/Ordinance Subject _____

Staff Recommendation

<input type="checkbox"/> GREEN Adopt based on tradeoffs outlined on next page	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YELLOW Defer to a later designated date or the annual Budget Process	<input type="checkbox"/> RED Recommend Council not adopt nominated idea	<input type="checkbox"/> NEEDS CLARIFICATION OR MORE TIME TO EVALUATE
---	--	---	---

Staff Evaluation

Is this already underway in a department work plan? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	Is this time critical or an emergency? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	Will this require substantial resources, staffing, budget, strategic support, or reprioritizing existing work plan? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
--	---	--

Criterion to Determine Scale of Project Complexity

Project complexity is determined by scoring the project in each of the 3 criteria below and then summing the score.

a. Low Complexity is a sum of 6 or less.
 b. Medium Complexity is a sum of 7 – 9. Total Score = 14
 c. High Complexity is a sum of 10 or greater.

		Low Complexity	Medium Complexity	High Complexity	
	Scoring Criterion	Estimated Duration	6 – 9 months <input type="checkbox"/> = 1	9 - 18 months <input type="checkbox"/> = 2	More than 18 months <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> = 3
(Internal)		Organizational Complexity Can easily be absorbed into existing work plan	<input type="checkbox"/> = 1	Planned work (future) <input type="checkbox"/> = 2	Work not currently proposed <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> = 3
		Have staff with required skillset/knowledge	<input type="checkbox"/> = 1	Have staff with required skillset/ requires moderate research <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> = 2	Do not have staff with required skillset/requires significant research <input type="checkbox"/> = 3
		Less than or equal 2 staff required	<input type="checkbox"/> = 1	3 - 4 staff required <input type="checkbox"/> = 2	More than 5 staff required <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> = 3
(External)		1 Additional department; no community outreach required <input type="checkbox"/> = 1	2 Other departments Involved; some community outreach required <input type="checkbox"/> = 2	3 or more departments and/or external partners involved; significant community outreach required <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> = 3	

DEPT. Required	<input type="checkbox"/> Airport	<input type="checkbox"/> Auditor	<input type="checkbox"/> CMO	<input type="checkbox"/> OEDCA	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ESD	<input type="checkbox"/> Fire	<input type="checkbox"/> HR	<input type="checkbox"/> IT	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PRNS	<input type="checkbox"/> Police	<input type="checkbox"/> Retirement
	<input type="checkbox"/> Attorney	<input type="checkbox"/> Clerk	<input type="checkbox"/> CMO – Budget	<input type="checkbox"/> Community Energy	<input type="checkbox"/> Finance	<input type="checkbox"/> Housing	<input type="checkbox"/> IPA	<input type="checkbox"/> Library	<input type="checkbox"/> PBCE	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PW	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> DOT

CMO Approval: /s/ Lee Wilcox Date 5/28/2024

Analysis

Explain the rationale for staff recommendation, including any mitigating factors that need to be considered (recent legislative action, significant work plan changes, etc.). Please address the following as well.

GREEN LIGHT: The Administration can implement this nominated idea under its current work plan. Item should be sent to Council to add to department work plan. (1) How will the idea be approached? (2) If adopted, what is its impact and/or tradeoff to the City Council Focus Area or to a department work plan, including strategic support? (3) What is the minimum viable scope to move the idea forward and reduce its complexity?

YELLOW LIGHT: Administration recommends Council defer this nominated idea to a later designated date or the annual Budget Process due to (describe cost implications, workload impacts, or other factors)

SUMMARY -- Shifting all waste operations from the South Yard to the Mabury or West Yards would require staff prioritization and significant budgetary investments as both Mabury and West are at capacity. If City Council were interested in exploring a lower-cost, phased approach, it could invest \$300,000-\$500,000 to pay for disposal of BSJ and Parks Division waste at an "outside/non-City" transfer station. The latter option would still require significant staff time, analysis, and conversations with partners, but could be achieved in the next fiscal year, allowing staff to evaluate the impact of the one-time investment and report back findings to City Council. Importantly, staff will continue to monitor and improve on the established good neighbor efforts regardless of the decision made with this referral. [Analysis Below]

RED LIGHT: The Administration recommends Council not to adopt this nominated idea due to (describe reason implementation would be difficult if not impossible – conflict with other laws, etc.).

Analysis (Continued)

[Department Impacts]

PRNS: 1) Significant increase in time and cost to debris operations for BeautifySJ (BSJ) and Parks Division (2,000 tons of diverted debris, 25% reduction in productivity for BSJ); 2) Potential costs and time required to establish new dump and debris procedures with haulers and landfills (over \$500,000 increased hauling charges)

DOT: 1) Diversion could lead to Capital Improvement needs at both the Mabury and West Yards and require new and extensive regulatory oversight (Potential cost and environmental issues would be explored by ESD); 2) With a \$294 million DPW facilities backlog there is no identified funding source for these improvements or scope development (Requires coordination with DPW; cost likely to exceed \$2-3 million); 3) Mabury Yard would be closed at least 12 days per month to haul out material--either South Yard must be used or West Yard (which is very remote on Williams Rd.)

[Analysis]

The City of San José South Yard hosts Department of Transportation (DOT), Public Works, and Parks Recreation and Neighborhood Services (PRNS) operations. As the primary tenant of the facility, DOT's pavement, signs, and markings teams are based there. The purpose of the yard is to house these operations and stage construction material, but teams deposit collected illegal dumps and related debris at a designated yard location designed to handle waste. These teams are primarily based in the PRNS BeautifySJ program.

The main impact of this move would fall on the parks maintenance, illegal dumping, litter, and encampment management groups. The BeautifySJ team alone takes approximately 2,000 tons of debris to the South Yard annually primarily from the RAPID-Illegal Dumping program that includes appliances and trash bags, as well as BSJ bags from volunteer litter pickup events. The Mabury Yard, located at 1404 Mabury Rd, is DOT's primary Corporation Yard, is currently at capacity, and already receives 2,900 tons of debris from the BeautifySJ program. If 2,000 additional tons of debris were taken to the Mabury Yard rather than the South Yard, staff estimate this would double the number of days the debris is off-hauled from Mabury such that the yard would be closed to accepting waste for twelve days a month instead of six. This would leave the West Corporation Yard as the only site available for debris which would lead to impacts there as the trash load increases. Travel times to the West Yard are also longer since it is at the western boundary of the city limits and it is approximately 13 miles away from the South Yard as shown in the attachment, which can add more than 30 minutes in drive time with moderate traffic. Due to current West Yard capacity, staff would also need to take some trash and debris directly to the Newby Island landfill. This redirection to other locations is estimated to have service response impacts that will be negatively reflected in performance targets unless additional resources are provided to the program. For example, without additional resources, staff estimate a minimum 25% reduction in the number of work order responses that could be completed which equates to approximately 6,750 fewer requests annually. That is, whereas RAPID could previously respond to requests in 5 days, response times would increase between 6-8 days. Additionally, the BeautifySJ team relies on rented pickup trucks while awaiting new heavy load trucks to arrive. The smaller operating equipment would equate to more trips to transfer stations. To mitigate some of these service level reductions, the City Council could fund an additional team costing approximately \$360,000 for staff, vehicle, and other needed equipment, or it could provide additional funding between \$300,000-\$500,000 to pay for disposal of materials at a transfer station (Valley Recycle or Green Waste). The latter option would still require staff time to develop new routing and have conversations with key partners and vendors to provide a more precise estimate.

Analysis (Continued)

The Parks Division would experience similar issues to that of BSJ, though at a different magnitude. Importantly, "travel time" was called out for analysis and improvement in the 2020 park maintenance audit. The increased travel time will reduce the hours available for direct maintenance activities in the field and decrease the ability to effectively maintain parks. More time spent driving to disposal sites results in less time for park maintenance and operations, impacting overall efficiency and will likely result in higher fuel costs as longer travel distances will lead to higher fuel consumption. This budgetary impact is unknown, however it will divert funds from other crucial maintenance activities.

If expanding trash storage at the Mabury Yard were pursued because of its central location, it would require updating existing permits with multiple regulatory agencies and most likely lead to significant capital improvement requirements. The cost of this modification could exceed several million dollars in one-time permit costs and facility upgrades to both the Mabury and West Corporation Yards to establish them as permitted transfer stations, at least \$500,000 annually for contracts with new disposal sites, and increased ongoing annual staff costs of approximately \$570,000 for DOT staff to haul to alternate locations. However the full magnitude of the impact cannot be calculated without further analysis and work.

[Existing Good Neighbor Policy and Department Efforts]

The South Yard and Walnut Mobile Home Park have been neighbors for over 30 years, and have had several community meetings. Prior to the meeting in March of 2024, DOT and the residents met and discussed a "good neighbor policy" in 2017. The measures, with recent updates are shown below:

Noise - Metal recycling bins have been moved away from the sound wall and contract trucking vendors have been told to turn off vehicles while loading. DOT installed signage in loading/unloading areas and coordinated with Fleet to turn off compressor overnight which is re-emphasized with additional signage.

Dust - The water system has been upgraded with a second sprinkler installed in late 2023 to help control dust. A water truck is used on hauling days to help suppress dust. This area is surrounded by hills, vegetation, and a vacant lot, where dust can also originate on windy days.

Odor/Rats - The debris area is cleaned out every 1-2 weeks with efforts by PRNS/BSJ to minimize organic waste. DOT had an exterminator on retainer from 2017 to 2023. That contract was terminated when the exterminator stated there were no rats originating from the yard and they likely originated from multiple nearby areas. Based on resident request, DOT is restarting the exterminator contract and will monitor to see if a rodent problem emerges.

[Next Steps to Consider - Budget Process and Prioritization]

The full closure of the South Yard for debris operations would have significant programmatic, budgetary, and regulatory impacts on multiple City Departments. If City Council wished to pursue this change, it would require prioritization of the body of work for FY 2024-2025 to detail precise programmatic impacts, engagement with regulatory agencies and private vendors, as well as to provide a detailed budgetary impact for Council consideration for the development of the FY 2025-2026 budget. As noted below, proceeding with this change would require programmatic changes to BeautifySJ specifically, as well as potential major infrastructure changes to at least one other City-run Yard. Alternatively, City Council could explore a phased approach that diverts debris from a specific set of programs on a one-time basis to better understand the impacts. Any scenario will require further discussion with key partners.

Corp Yard Staging Areas & Landfill

City of San Jose South Service Yard



San Jose City - West Yard



City of San Jose Mabury Yard



Newby Island Recovery

